

EPHING FOREST DISTRICT COUNCIL COMMITTEE MINUTES

Committee: Area Planning Sub-Committee **Date:** 3 June 2015
South

Place: Roding Valley High School, Brook **Time:** 7.30 - 9.47 pm
Road, Loughton, Essex IG10 3JA

Members Present: J Hart, N Wright, K Chana, H Kauffman, G Mohindra, A Patel, C P Pond, C C Pond, C Roberts, B Sandler, T Thomas, L Wagland, S Weston and D Wixley

Other Councillors:

Apologies: K Angold-Stephens, G Chambers, R Jennings, J Knapman, A Lion, H Mann and S Watson

Officers Present: S Solon (Principal Planning Officer), A Hendry (Democratic Services Officer), T Carne (Public Relations and Marketing Officer) and S Kitts (Licensing Officer)

1. WEBCASTING INTRODUCTION

The Chairman made a short address to remind all present that the meeting would be broadcast on the Internet, and that the Council had adopted a protocol for the webcasting of its meetings.

2. MINUTES

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the last meeting of the Sub-Committee held on 29 April 2015 be agreed and signed by the Chairman as a correct record.

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

(a) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Conduct, Councillor A Patel declared a non-pecuniary interest in the following item of the agenda. The Councillor advised that he had previously considered this application as a Parish Councillor but would now look at it in light of the full report and new evidence produced in this agenda and consider it afresh.

- EPF/0097/15 – St Elisabeths Church, Chestnut Avenue, Buckhurst Hill

(b) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Conduct, Councillor J Hart declared a non-pecuniary interest in the following item of the agenda. The Councillor

advised that he attends St John's Church but in a non-leadership position and that therefore he would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon.

- EPF/0097/15 – St Elisabeths Church, Chestnut Avenue, Buckhurst Hill

(c) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Conduct, Councillor J Hart declared a non-pecuniary interest in the following item of the agenda. The Councillor advised that that he would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon.

- EPF/0097/15 – St Elisabeths Church, Chestnut Avenue, Buckhurst Hill

4. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

It was noted that there was no urgent business for consideration by the Sub-Committee.

5. DEVELOPMENT CONTROL

The Sub-Committee considered a schedule of applications for planning permission.

RESOLVED:

That the planning applications numbered 1 – 9 be determined as set out in the attached schedule to these minutes.

CHAIRMAN

Report Item No: 1

| | |
|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/2210/14 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | 153 Manor Road Chigwell Essex IG7 5QA |
| PARISH: | Chigwell |
| WARD: | Grange Hill |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | First floor extension above existing outbuilding to create ancillary annexe |
| DECISION: | Approved, subject to s106 Agreement |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=568290

Members agreed to approve this application subject to a s106 agreement requiring the annexe to only be used in conjunction with, and ancillary to, the main dwelling and subject to the following conditions:

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 The development hereby permitted will be completed strictly in accordance with the approved drawings nos: DWG 1, DWG 2, DWG3 and DWG 4
- 3 The development hereby permitted will be completed strictly in accordance with the approved drawings nos: DWG 1, DWG 2, DWG3 and DWG 4

Report Item No: 2

| | |
|---------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0097/15 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | Saint Elisabeth's Church Chestnut Avenue Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 6BN |
| PARISH: | Buckhurst Hill |
| WARD: | Buckhurst Hill East |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Demolition of existing church and hall and erection of 7 new 3 storey flats and 7 new houses with associated car parking and small community facility. |
| DECISION: | Refuse Permission |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM_websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=573179

REASONS FOR REFUSAL

- 1 By reason of its massing, cramped layout and detailed design, the proposal would appear incongruous, forming a sharp contrast with prevailing pattern of development adjacent to the site. As a consequence, it would cause significant harm to the character and appearance of the locality, contrary to adopted Local Plan and Alterations policies CP2(iv), CP7 and DBE1, which are consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.
- 2 The proposal would result in the unjustified loss of a non-designated heritage asset, contrary to adopted Local Plan and Alterations policy HC13A and the provisions of the National Planning Policy Framework, particularly paragraph 135.

WAY FORWARD

Members suggested that a possible way forward would be for a revised proposal providing some space between buildings, with less bulky buildings that more closely complement the detailed design of neighbouring houses on Chestnut Avenue, and Hornbeam Road is likely to address the Council's first reason for refusal.

The submission of evidence of the viability of re-using the existing buildings together with evidence of the need for a community facility at the application site is necessary to address the Council's second reason for refusal.

Report Item No: 3

| | |
|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0178/15 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | Oak Field House Debden Road Loughton Essex IG10 2NY |
| PARISH: | Loughton |
| WARD: | Loughton St Johns |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Erection of a single bay extension to existing oak barn to the rear of the house. |
| DECISION: | Grant Permission (With Conditions) |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM_websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=573397

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed development shall match those of the existing barn building, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Report Item No: 4

| | |
|---------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0336/15 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | 15 The Shrubberies Chigwell Essex IG7 5DU |
| PARISH: | Chigwell |
| WARD: | Grange Hill |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Proposed two storey side extension and first floor rear extension. |
| DECISION: | Grant Permission (With Conditions) |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM_websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=573736

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed development shall match those of the existing building, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 3 All construction/demolition works and ancillary operations, including vehicle movement on site which are audible at the boundary of noise sensitive premises, shall only take place between the hours of 07.30 to 18.30 Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 hours on Saturday, and at no time during Sundays and Public/Bank Holidays unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Report Item No: 5

| | |
|---------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0498/15 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | Woodberrie Woodbury Hill Loughton Essex IG10 1JB |
| PARISH: | Loughton |
| WARD: | Loughton St Johns |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Proposed dwelling adjacent to Woodberrie. |
| DECISION: | Refuse Permission |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=574162

REASONS FOR REFUSAL

- 1 By reason of its siting and bulk, the proposed house would significantly detract from outlook from nos 13 and 15 Woodbury Hill to the detriment of their living conditions. Accordingly, the proposal is contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policy DBE2, which is consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.
- 2 By reason of its scale and siting the proposed house would result in the significant erosion of the spacious and semi-rural character of this part of the York Hill Conservation Area. Consequently, the proposal fails to preserve its character, contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policy HC6 which is consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.

WAY FORWARD

Having regard to the constraints of the site, its relationship to 13 and 15 Woodbury Hill and the semi-rural character of this part of the York Hill Conservation Area, Members concluded there is no way forward for this proposal.

Report Item No: 6

| | |
|---------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0533/15 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | 32 Marjorams Avenue Loughton Essex IG10 1PU |
| PARISH: | Loughton |
| WARD: | Loughton St Johns |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Two storey and single storey rear extension. Remove front of garage. Raise patio by 0.8m and erect side fence 1.8m height from patio. |
| DECISION: | Grant Permission (With Conditions) |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM_websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=574217

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed development shall match those of the existing house, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 3 All construction/demolition works and ancillary operations, including vehicle movement on site which are audible at the boundary of noise sensitive premises, shall only take place between the hours of 07.30 to 18.30 Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 hours on Saturday, and at no time during Sundays and Public/Bank Holidays unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Report Item No: 7

| | |
|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0600/15 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | 301 High Road Loughton Essex IG10 1AH |
| PARISH: | Loughton |
| WARD: | Loughton St Marys |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Display one full length fascia sign with internally illuminated letters and logos and one internally illuminated projecting sign. |
| DECISION: | Grant Permission |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=574379

CONDITIONS

NONE

Report Item No: 8

| | |
|---------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0645/15 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | 94 Lawton Road Loughton Essex IG10 2AA |
| PARISH: | Loughton |
| WARD: | Loughton Fairmead |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Residential development comprising 5 no. 2 bed apartments and 2 no. 1 bed apartments. |
| DECISION: | Refuse Permission |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=574496

REASONS FOR REFUSAL

- 1 By reason of its size and siting within a constrained site, the proposed development would have a cramped appearance, out of keeping with that of the locality. The degree of contrast with the established pattern of development in the locality would be significant and harmful to its character and appearance. Accordingly, the proposal is contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policies CP2(iv), CP7 and DBE1, which are consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.
- 2 By reason of its relationship and proximity to the rear garden boundaries of 92 to 108 Lawton Road and 1 to 8 Pyrles Lane, the proposal would be likely to result in excessive overlooking of the rear gardens of those houses on Lawton Road. It would also appear excessively overbearing when seen from the rear gardens of 96, 98 and 108 Lawton Road and 2, 4, 6 and 8 Pyrles Lane. Accordingly, the proposal would cause excessive harm to the amenities of those dwellinghouses, contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policies DBE2 and DBE9, which are consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.
- 3 The proposal provides for less than half of the minimum number of car parking spaces required in order to comply with Essex County Council Parking Standards (September 2009). The degree of shortfall is such that the proposal is likely to generate increased demand for on-street vehicle parking on adjacent streets with a harmful consequence for the amenities of the locality and the interest of highway safety. Accordingly the proposal is contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policy ST6, which is consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.

WAY FORWARD

Members considered a more spacious single storey development such as bungalows would be more appropriate for this site.

Report Item No: 9

| | |
|---------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0685/15 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | 3 Brancaster Place Church Hill Loughton Essex IG10 1QN |
| PARISH: | Loughton |
| WARD: | Loughton St Marys |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Conversion of existing garage to habitable area. |
| DECISION: | Grant Permission (With Conditions) |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=574637

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed development shall match those of the existing building, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 3 All construction/demolition works and ancillary operations, including vehicle movement on site which are audible at the boundary of noise sensitive premises, shall only take place between the hours of 07.30 to 18.30 Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 hours on Saturday, and at no time during Sundays and Public/Bank Holidays unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

This page is intentionally left blank